

siècle tendency to refer to Spain's problems in medical terms: "Tomadle el pulso a España—ahora parece que lo ha recobrado, que pulso hay, aunque desatento y febril" ("Take the pulse of Spain—it now seems like it has recovered it, although it is irregular and feverish"; *Vigies por Europa* 596).

Several other travel writings by Pardo Bazán make excellent readings for students. In "Francial Aqual Paris" ("France! That Paris"; *Vigies por Europa* 133–45), she offers interesting comparisons between Spain and France that allow students to see what France meant for the Spanish imaginary of the time. "Diversiones; gente rara" ("Diversions; Weird People"; *Vigies por Europa* 385–97) is one of several articles in which she describes her visit to the 1889 World Exposition in Paris. It includes prejudiced descriptions of people and races from other continents. She also offers interesting opinions about the United States, with reflections on characters such as Buffalo Bill, whom she compares to El Cid Campeador: "Notas portuguesas" ("Portuguese Notes"; *Vigies por Europa* 661–67) deals with cultural differences and similarities between Portugal and Spain. In "Castilla. Fondas y posadas" ("Castile: Guest Houses and Inns"; *Vigies por España* 319–22) she criticizes the poor quality of hotels and service in Madrid. She describes different types of travels and travelers and lists the traits of a good traveler. Finally, "Las chinches; Viajar en automóvil" ("Bedbugs; Traveling by Car"; *Vigies por España* 415–22), written in 1915, is one of Pardo Bazán's last travel essays. The author reflects upon the advantages of traveling in Spain by car, a new invention at the time, and offers recommendations for improving tourism in Spain.

By reading Pardo Bazán's travel writing students get an understanding of the challenges faced by Spain at the turn of the twentieth century. Furthermore, students comprehend how the aesthetic and ideological frames employed by foreign and local travelers filter their perceptions and generate startlingly different views of Spain. Pardo Bazán is usually studied as a feminist who also introduced the naturalist movement to the Spanish literary public in the late nineteenth century. The readings for my class reframe the Galician author as an intellectual of the twentieth century who was completely engaged in contemporary discussions about Spanish identity and the future of the nation.

NOTES

¹ Pardo Bazán's travel writing has not been published in English. For my class I use an unpublished translation by Professor Lee Chambers. Jennifer J. Wood's book on Spanish women travelers includes a chapter on Pardo Bazán's travel writing and translates several fragments.

² Translations are my own.

Teaching Cultural Difference through Translation: Pardo Bazán's *Insolación*

Jennifer Smith

To help students overcome their initial reluctance to read a nineteenth-century text, I suggest they approach the work as a search for answers to questions personally relevant to them. In teaching the works of Emilia Pardo Bazán, for example, I have found that her concern with gender issues speaks to many students, no matter their linguistic or cultural background. Yet I also stress that an informed reading involves appreciating how the text differs from their lives and experiences. For this reason I encourage them to look for elements of the text they identify with as well as for those that are foreign to them. While studying the historical context of a work and the biography of its author can foster understanding of such cultural differences between a text and a reader's own experience, I have found that asking students to translate specific passages that are less accessible to them can effectively highlight details that otherwise may be overlooked. My own experience bears this out: not until I had to grapple with translating certain passages from *Insolación* (1889; "Sunstroke") did I realize not only how difficult they were for me to render into English but also how much of the text's richness I had missed by glossing over certain cultural and linguistic elements. Based on this realization and the benefits I gained from the process, I now have my students translate passages of *Insolación* into English in a class on Spanish realism and naturalism that combines undergraduate and graduate students. My students are a mix of native English speakers from the United States and native Spanish speakers from Latin America. For all my students, Pardo Bazán's work is foreign temporally, culturally, and, to greater or lesser degrees, linguistically.

For translation exercises I choose passages that deal with issues of social class, regional identities, and ethnicities, since they are inextricably tied to the time and place of the work, not readily comprehended by students, consistently represented across Pardo Bazán's works, and currently studied by contemporary critics.¹ Before considering how to translate specific passages, we discuss some of the ways translation can elucidate cultural and foreignization from Lawrence Venuti's book *The Translator's Invisibility: A History of Translation*. Domestication aims to make a text conform to the target language and the target culture, whereas foreignization seeks to underscore the temporal and cultural differences between the source text and the translation (15). I give some examples of domestication—the decision to have African Americans speak with Cuban accents in the Spanish dubbing of the film *Gone with the Wind* (Gubern and Vernon 378) and John Rutherford's decision to translate *cocido* as "chick-pea stew" in his translation of *La Regenta* ("The Regent's Wife") (Rutherford 165–66).

Examples of foreignization include the retention of certain features or words of the Spanish language. Rutherford, for example, explains that he tried to preserve the unique linguistic and cultural references of *La Regenta* by retaining the Spanish names of characters, streets, and places; Leopoldo Alas's use of the historical past tense (common in Spanish but unusual in English); as well as the author's somewhat convoluted syntax (166–67). Discussing such interpretive decisions makes students more aware of how their translations could either emphasize the foreignness of the text or appropriate the text into their own culture. I tell them that while domestication is the more common translation practice, as most readers prefer to have the unfamiliar made familiar to make the reading easier, Venuti denounces domestication as a form of violence that erases the unique culture of the original work (14).

Following the discussion of approaches to translation, I introduce the historical context of the novel. *Insolación*, like many of Pardo Bazán's novels and short stories, is populated with characters from a variety of socioeconomic, regional, and ethnic backgrounds, and markers of these categories are inscribed in the language the characters speak. I begin with a discussion of social class in Spain at the end of the nineteenth century, stressing that despite the progressive dismantling of the old regime, mainly through the disenfranchisement of Church and aristocratic lands (Carr, "Liberalism" 208–09), Spain lagged behind other European nations in terms of industrialization (Bahamonde and Martínez 471). While this meant that Spain remained primarily an agricultural society, the aristocracy now had to share power with a small but growing middle class (455–56). This situation is reflected in *Insolación*: while the lower middle class is almost completely absent, the ruling class comprises titled aristocracy (the protagonist, Asís de Taboada, Marchioness de Andrade; the Duchess of Sahagún), untitled aristocracy (Gabriel Pardo de la Lage), and a member of the upper bourgeoisie (Diego Pacheco). Because the novel has an urban setting, the lower classes are represented not by rural peasantry but by *chulos* (working-class people of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century Madrid), *cigarreros* (tobacco workers), domestic help, and gypsies.

Chulos are typical of Madrid and represent the idea of cultural authenticity, of the real Spain. They are defined largely by social class and are signaled in the novel by their attire and speech. Showing students images of *chulos* and their characteristic dress is helpful, as Pardo Bazán's conception of a *chulo* is foreign to most students who are not from Spain. Joaquina Balmaseda's "La chula madrileña" and Pardo Bazán's sketch of the *chula* in "La mujer española" (108–11), although stereotypical portrayals, are useful for understanding what the *chula* represented in the cultural imagination of the time. Since the *chulos* do not speak for themselves in *Insolación* as much as the *cigarreros* and gypsies do, there are only a few passages to work with: the scene where the *chulos* yell out *pitropos* (catcalls) to Asís in front of the Cibeles fountain, the brief scene where Pacheco asks a *chulo* on the street for the whereabouts of a restaurant, and the scene where a *chula* enters the *merendero* (open-air restaurant) at the fair to try

to sell the couple flowers (41, 55–56, 63–64). In the first example students can contrast the *chulos'* speech with that of Asís, who narrates this section; in the other two examples students could try their hand at representing the character of the Andalusian Pacheco who, although a gentleman, speaks with a regional dialect.

The *cigarreros* can be treated similarly. While *chulos* are specifically associated with Madrid, the *cigarrera* figure transcends regions. Many *chulas* also worked as *cigarreras* (Balmaseda 261), but the *cigarrera* was by no means unique to Madrid. The Spanish government nationalized tobacco manufacturing in the late eighteenth century, and by 1914 there were ten national tobacco factories in Spain, the first and most famous being the one in Seville (Shubert 39–40).² The overwhelming majority of tobacco factory workers were women, and the *cigarreras* became famous for their outspokenness, flirtatiousness, and political activism (O'Connor 152–53), a stereotype that was most famously popularized in Prosper Mérimée's *Carmen* (1845) and later, in Henri Meilhac and Georges Bizet's operatic adaptation of Mérimée's work of the same name (Shubert 39–40). I point out to students that in Mérimée and in the opera *Carmen* is both a gypsy and a *cigarrera*. The *cigarrera*, because she might also be a *chula* and a gypsy, was a figure who crossed ethnic and socioeconomic categories. Like *chulos*, *cigarreras* are defined by their thick accents and uncouth yet spontaneous and quaint behavior. Contemporary illustrations and photographs as well as Pardo Bazán's sketch of the *cigarrera* ("La cigarrera") can help students visualize these women. Students work with the scenes where the *cigarreras* comment on Diego and Asís soon after their arrival at the *fonda* in Las Ventas, the scene where la señora Donata asks Diego to help get one of her granddaughters a job at the factory, and the scene where the *cigarreras* watch Pacheco and Asís leave, speculating on their relationship (139–50).

Students also work with the scenes in chapters five and six in which gypsy characters are presented. There is a lengthy passage with the first gypsy fortune-teller and another with the *gitanilla* (little gypsy girl) who places a curse on the waitress who chases her away; I give students additional background about the Spanish Roma. Drawing largely on Lou Charon-Deutsch's book *The Spanish Gypsy: A History of a European Obsession* (2004), I explain that in Pardo Bazán's time, although linguistic evidence had already linked the origins of the Roma to India, many in Spain continued to insist on their Egyptian origins (7–9). Indeed, in *Insolación* the intra- and homodiegetic narrator refers to the gypsy women as "egipcias" (Egyptian women) (*Insolación* 60).³ I also discuss the contradictory portrayals of gypsies at the time as both Romantic symbols of nonconformity, passion, and nature and as the poor, uncivilized other, naturally inclined toward theft and trickery.

I structure these activities by dividing the class into groups and assigning the same passage to each group. The class uses my edition of the book, which includes English glosses of particularly difficult words and phrases. I remind students that if they choose a foreignized translation, footnotes might be necessary to explain

unknown terms. For a domesticated translation, students might want to consider what social stereotypes in American culture, from the late nineteenth century or the present, could represent a cultural equivalent for certain characters. Students also must decide how these characters will speak: for example, will their accents be transcribed phonetically, as Pardo Bazán did? I give examples of what a domesticated translation might look like: for the *chula*, perhaps a woman in a pink-collar profession such as waitressing or a blue-collar profession such as manufacturing; for Pacheco, a Southern gentleman; and for Asís, a woman with a British accent.

After the groups produce their translations, they share them with the class and we compare them with both the original Spanish and with Amparo Loring's 1907 translation, *Midsummer Madness*.⁴ The following examples, from the scene of the violent exchange between the *gitanilla* and the waitress at the *merendero* (*Insolación* 67; *Midsummer Madness* 57–58), are useful points of comparison for the class to discuss:

“¿Hase visto hato de pindongas?” (“How dare you come here, you gad-about baggage?”)

“¿No dejarán comer en paz a las personas decentes?” (“Can't decent folks eat their victuals in peace?”)

“¿Conque las barre uno por un lado y se cuelan por otro? ¿Y cómo habrá entrado aquí semejante calamidá, digo yo?” (“Snakes nest of gypsies! Sweep one away, and another drops on your head. How did this abomination get in, I wonder?”)

“Pues si no te largas más pronto que la luz, bofetá como la que te arrimo no la has visto tú en tu vía.” (“Make tracks like lightning, or you'll get such a crack as you never felt in all your life!”).

“Te doy un recorrido al cuerpo, que no te queda lengua pa contarlo.” (“I'll dress you down so that you'll have no tongue left to tell of it!”)

La chiguilla huyó más lista que un cohele; pero no habrían transcurrido dos segundos, cuando vimos entreabrírse la lona que nos protegía las espaldas, y por la rendija del lienzo asomó una jeta que parecía la del mismo enemigo, unos dientes que rechinaban, un puño cerrado, negro como una bola de bronce, y la gitaniella berreó. . . . (The gypsy darted off like a rocket. But two seconds later the canvas behind me parted, and we saw a foaming mouth, bristling with sharp teeth, and a bronzed fist which the gypsy shook as she bellowed. . . .)

“Arrastrá, condená, tía cochina, que malos retortijones te arranquen las tripas, y malos mengues te jagan picallo e los jégados, y malas culebras te piquen, y remardita tñña te pegue con er moño pa que te quedes pelá como tu ifunta agñeala. . . .” (“Tadel! Castaway! She-devil!” [We are obliged to soften the language.] “May poisonous adders sting you! May your hair drop out till you are as bald as your carrion grandmother!”)

Next, I pose the following questions to prompt the students to analyze their own and Loring's translations:

- How did you and Loring translate colloquial words and passages?
- How did you approach archaic usages (e.g., *hase*) and phonetic transcriptions of character dialects?
- Do the translations feel Spanish or American?
- Do the translations sound contemporary or from the turn of the century?
- What aspects of Loring's translation make it sound foreign to a present-day American reader?
- Where did you and Loring change the syntax or sentence order? Why and to what effect?
- Where did you and Loring eliminate words or sentences? Why and to what effect?
- How is Loring's translation different from your own?
- What works well and what does not work well in your and Loring's translations?

It's also interesting for the class to discuss Loring's translation of the title—*Midsummer Madness* for *Insolación*—and the replacement of Pardo Bazán's dedication to José Lázaro Galdiano with the translator's dedication to the Marquis of Casa-Loring.

Another aspect of this exercise is translating cultural phenomena that are particular to the late nineteenth century. Among many possibilities in the novel, three make especially good examples: *sainete*, Abanico, and Worth. A *sainete* is a short, comic, one-act play featuring characters from the lower classes. This entertainment was initially staged between the acts of longer plays and, in the late nineteenth century, in combination with other one-act plays in the so-called *teatros por horas* (theater by the hour). The *sainete* brings to mind a certain representation of an authentic yet farcical Spain that the popular classes represent—such a representation is an important theme in the novel. Loring translates “sainete de don Ramón de la Cruz” (38) as a “burlesque by Ramón de la Cruz” (18) and “más divertída que en un sainete” (64) as “all this entertained me more than a play” (55). For each instance, I ask students what Loring's translation preserves from the original, what is lost, and how they would translate the passage. The second example, Abanico, is mentioned by the waitress who calls the gypsies thieves after the second gypsy woman leaves the *merendero*: “Y está la romería plagada de estas tunantas, embusteronas. Lástima de Abanico” (63). Abanico is a reference to Madrid's Cárcel Modelo, the main prison in the capital during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Modeled on Jeremy Bentham's Panopticon, it acquired its nickname because it was shaped like a fan (*abanico*).⁵ Loring omits any reference to the prison and translates this passage as “The Fair is overrun with that kind of vermin, more's the pity” (53). Students

can be asked to discuss what is lost by the translator's omission of this specificity. Finally, the novel makes a reference to the famous nineteenth-century English tailor Charles Frederick Worth (85), the so-called father of haute couture. Worth was well known in Loring's day, so Loring simply maintains the original (80). The reference, however, would be lost on many readers today. Students can be asked how they would translate this—would they substitute something more contemporary like Versace?

Returning to Venuti's argument that the domestication approach to translation is a form of linguistic and cultural violence, my final question asks students how much of the original culture and language was lost in their translations and why these elements were sacrificed. Building on Walter Benjamin's assertion that the "basic error" of the translator "is that he preserves the state in which his own language happens to be instead of allowing his language to be powerfully affected by the foreign tongue" (82), I conclude by encouraging students to think about how preserving the foreign elements of *Insolación* could add to the richness of the English language and English-speaking cultures.

NOTES

I would like to express my gratitude to Joyce Tolliver, who took the time to brainstorm with me and generously shared her translation-theory materials. References to *Insolación* refer to my 2011 edition.

¹ Recent studies on *Insolación* have focused largely on questions of national identity, social class, and race. See Amann; Heneghan, "Fashion"; Perera-Muro, "Parecía"; Smith, "Cultural Capital"; Smith, "Gypsy's Curse"; Tsuchiya, *Marginal Subjects* 136–61.

² The factory in Madrid opened in 1809 under the rule of Joseph Bonaparte and employed between 3,000 and 5,000 people, almost all of whom were women (Vallejo Fernández Cela 137), while the factory in A Coruña, Galicia, which Pardo Bazán visited to do research for her novel *La Tribuna*, opened in 1804 and by 1886 was employing between 3,500 and 4,000 women (Aira).

³ See also Pardo Bazán's short story "Maldición gitana" ("Gypsy Curse"; *Cuentos completos* 1: 318–21).

⁴ As far as I have been able to ascertain, this is the only English translation of *Insolación*.
⁵ See the note by Ermitas Penas Varela in the 2001 Cátedra edition of *Insolación* (128n49).

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

Marvellen Bieder is professor emerita of Spanish at Indiana University, Bloomington. She has written extensively on Pardo Bazán and Concepción Gimeno de Flaquer as well as on Carmen de Burgos. Her current research is on women's networks, including Pardo Bazán's literary friendships. Previously she published widely on contemporary Spanish- and Catalan-language writers, including Juan Goytisolo, Mercè Rodoreda, Manuel Vázquez Montalbán, Carme Riera, and Marina Mayoral. She has edited, with Roberta Johnson, *Spanish Women Writers and Spain's Civil War* and coedited the nineteenth-century chapter of *A New History of Iberian Feminisms*. She also published *Narrative Perspective in the Post-Civil War Novels of Francisco Ayala*.

Alicia Cerezo is assistant professor at the University of Wisconsin, Madison. She teaches nineteenth- and twentieth-century Peninsular literature and culture. She has published articles on the visual and textual representations of women in illustrated periodicals, sketches of everyday life, and turn-of-the-century novels; on spiritualism; on *costumbrismo*, including its manifestations in contemporary television; and on silent film. Her publications have appeared in *Revista de estudios hispánicos*, *Letras feministas*, *Journal of Spanish Cultural Studies*, *Decimonónica*, *Journal of Hispanic Modernism*, and *Hispanófila*. She edited, with Ryan Davis, *Modernity and Epistemology in Nineteenth-Century Spain: Fringe Discourses*. She is also the author of *Cada espíritu es un libro: Espiritismo, ciencia y sociedad en el fin de siglo*.

Lou Channon-Deutsch is professor emerita of Hispanic languages and literature at Stony Brook University. She specializes in nineteenth-century Spanish narrative and visual culture. Her books include *Hold That Pose: Visual Culture in the Nineteenth Century Spanish Press*, *The Spanish Gypsy: A History of a European Obsession*, *Fictions of the Feminine in the Nineteenth-Century Spanish Press*, *Narratives of Desire: Nineteenth-Century Spanish Fiction by Women*, *Culture and Gender in Nineteenth-Century Spain* (edited with Jo Labanyi), and *Gender and Representation: Women in Spanish Realist Fiction*. She has served on the editorial boards of *Hispanic Research Journal*, *Letras feministas*, *Revista de estudios hispánicos*, *Journal of Spanish Cultural Studies*, *Decimonónica*, and *La Tribuna*.

Isabel Clúa is lecturer in the Department of Spanish and Latin American Literature at the Universidad de Sevilla, where she teaches Spanish literature and cultural studies. She is a member of the research group Creació i pensament de les dones and researcher at the Centre Dona i Literatura, both at the Universitat de Barcelona. Her work focuses on mechanisms of gender construction and identity in European fin de siècle culture; she also investigates contemporary popular culture from the perspective of feminist cultural studies. Since 2011 she is codirector of the peer-reviewed journal *Revista de dones i textualitat*.

Denise DuPont is professor of Spanish in the Department of World Languages and Literatures at Southern Methodist University. She is a specialist in nineteenth-century Spanish literature and the author of *Writing Teresa: The Saint from Avila at the fin-de-siglo and Realism as Resistance: Romanticism and Authorship in Galdós, Clarín, and*

**Approaches to Teaching
the Writings of
Emilia Pardo Bazán**

Edited by

Margot Versteeg

and

Susan Walter
